

AN ANALYSIS OF POLITICAL APPOINTMENTS OF THE RECENT CONSERVATIVE GOVERNMENTS IN SOUTH KOREA

Minjeong Park,

Department of Public Administration,
the Graduate School, Yonsei University

E-mail: mjpark0691@gmail.com

Pan Suk Kim,

Department of Global Public Administration,
Yonsei University, Wonju, South Korea

E-mail: pankim@yonsei.ac.kr

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study is to examine what characterizes the political appointments of the recent conservative governments in South Korea. In this study, we will assess the political appointment of the latest two regimes' political executives by analyzing their backgrounds. In particular, we will focus on the ministers and vice-ministers of the Lee Myung-bak and Park Geun-hye governments. We collected data from websites of all ministries and newspapers dealing with the related background information. These data include information on appointees' major career, job relevancy, academic background, studying abroad and state examination for career. Also, we will consider political connections such as membership of the Commission on Presidential Transition and the same political party as the President, and appointees' affiliated college, birthplace, and gender to appraise the validity, on merit and diversity, of the two governments' political appointments.

Keywords: political appointment, minister, vice-minister, competence, political connection, representativeness

I. Introduction

South Korea has democratically achieved a peaceful turnover of political power since the 15th presidential election in 1997. Although the democracy of South Korea (hereafter Korea) has developed, there are still some doubts about the criteria and process of political appointments. In the recent conservative governments, new terms like 'Ko-So-Young,'¹ 'Kang-Boo-Ja,'² and 'Sung-Si-Kyoung,'³ emerged to indicate some characteristics of political

¹ It refers to those who graduated from Korea University, go to the Somang Church (where the President used to go), and originally came from the Youngnam region.

² Kangnam Boodongsan Jasanga indicates those who have a lot of real estates in Kangnam area district.

³ It means that someone graduated from Sungkyunkwan University (from where a number of powerful politicians graduated this university during the Lee-Myung-Bak Administration), passed the Sihum (the civil service entrance examination), and graduated from the Kyunggi High School (the best high school in South Korea in the past).

appointments. These terms also imply a critical perspective of the political appointees' particular common denominator like one's university, religion, region of origin, and state examination, such that whenever a president appoints someone as minister there is much debate and criticism.

People had high expectations for the personnel policy of President Park Geun-hye's government when the new government was officially launched. The president promised to appoint personnel not based on their political connections but based on their competency and merit to conduct efficient and democratic state affairs. This presidential election pledge is called 'Daetangpyeong' (greatly-balanced appointment policy). The President also promised to increase the ratio of female ministers to strengthen women's representativeness. Regarding this issue, the President Lee Myung-bak also promised to establish a gender quota system for political appointees to ensure gender equality in the public sector. Therefore it can be meaningful to check whether these pledges have been successfully fulfilled or not by examining political appointees in both administrations.

Personnel policies for ministers and vice-ministers among political appointees are very important given that they should manage government and resolve diverse social conflicts (Bae and Min, 2003). When we consider they belong to the ruling class who both monopolize and enjoy the advantages that power brings (Mosca, 1963: 50), the matter of their appointment needs to be critically discussed. From this important point of presidential appointments, we will try to research who are selected as ministers and vice-ministers and what characterizes their appointments.

In this study, we will assess the criteria for appointments of the recent conservative governments, the Lee Myung-bak Administration (2008-2013) and the Park Geun-Hye Administration (2013-present), in Korea. In particular, we will narrowly focus on the ministers and vice-ministers among the political appointees of the Lee Myung-bak and Park Geun-hye administrations. The criteria for political appointments can be divided into competence, political connection, and representativeness. The research will use these criteria to evaluate validity and suitability of the two governments' political appointments by collecting information about their ministers and vice-ministers.

This article proceeds as follows. First, we will provide background literature on the political appointments in Korea. Next, we will analyze the social background data in order to find out what characterizes the political appointments of the conservative governments. The results then follow. Finally, we will conclude with a discussion about the summarized results and a number of practical implications of this study as well as laying out several directions for future studies.

II. Previous Studies on Political Appointments in Korea

The system of political appointments comes from a history of the spoils or patronage system which is a practice where a ruling party, after winning a presidential election, gives government jobs to its supporters as a reward for working toward victory so that a political appointee is an employee who is appointed by the President or agency head. Over the years,

political appointees have been subject to more public scrutiny and ethical restrictions in a number of countries including the USA, Korea, and others.

Studies on political appointment were activated substantially when the people's demand for political development was high in the 1990s (Lee and Min, 2002; Bae and Min, 2003). Accordingly, we will review research about political appointments from the Kim Dae-jung Administration (1998-2003) to the Park Geun-hye Administration (2013-present) in this section. This research can be categorized into social-demographic backgrounds, roles and qualities, incumbency, determinants of entrance and exit, and leadership.

First, Kim (2002) examined the role of ministers based on the appointment criteria for ministers by way of political compensation, symbolic representativeness, general ability for management, and professionalism. Among the four expected roles of ministers, the political role of ministers is an important role in that they were in general appointed by the political criterion of presidents. Also, Ha (2015) focused on the appointments and roles of female ministers by not only analyzing literature but also directly interviewing fourteen former female ministers. She classified criteria for the appointments into competence relative to policy, political assets, symbolic representativeness, political compensation and also classified the activities and roles within them for planning policy, selecting policy, managing organization, and external relations. Among the criteria for the appointments, their former career background is an important factor for ministerial appointment.

Second, Sung (2015) studied some factors that have affected the length of ministerial tenure from 1948 to 2013. He concluded that the incumbency of ministers and the management of ministry are unexpected and unstable considering there are a variety of factors which affects the incumbency of ministers, such as the age of ministers, work experience in the ministry, the number of times they were elected as a member of the National Assembly, a local government head or local council, experience, and the timing of the appointment and so on.

Third, regarding the shuffling or resignation of appointed ministers, Lee and Min (2010) explored the reason why ministers were changed in the period from Park Chung-hee to the Roh Moo-hyun administration. The most common reason was to censure the minister's misconduct. Adversely, Sung (2014) studied the reason why ministers resign by categorizing into three characteristics. The determinants of ministerial resignations are related to personal characteristics like age and gender, political characteristics like experience of National Assembly, and presidential characteristics like rates of votes earned in the presidential election and the ruling party's National Assembly seat.

Fourth, research about vice-ministers is handled less and goes relatively unnoticed compared with research about ministers. Bae and Min (2003) examined the criteria for the appointment of vice-ministers to find the characteristics of appointment decisions from the Rhee Syng-man Administration to the Kim Dae-jung Administration. They considered competence, favoritism, the spoils system, and regional representativeness. Min (2006) focused on the issue of the regional representativeness by considering both ministers and

vice-ministers. The results were that the Youngnam area had been overrepresented but the Honam area had been underrepresented from the Rhee Syng-man to the Kim Dae-jung administrations. Interestingly, in this research, vice-ministers had less regional representativeness than ministers. Cho (2014) explored how new cabinet members are selected and what their characteristics are, in order to study the features and limitations of new cabinets. This study included not only ministers but also vice-ministers and dealt with the Kim Young-sam Administration to Park Geun-hye Administration.

These former studies examined characteristics of ministers and vice-ministers and appointment criteria relating to them. When the researchers studied the criteria for appointment of political appointees, they mainly used competence or performance, political compensation, and representativeness to analyze the social-demographic backgrounds and the equity of political appointments by setting, different governments and terms. However, there is a lack of research on the recent conservative governments of Lee Myung-bak and Park Geun-hye and on both minister and vice-minister in tandem. Research on the validity of the political appointments is also lacking despite its importance and a lot of criticism. So, we will try to explore the criteria for the appointment of political appointees in Korea by focusing on the ministers and vice-ministers of the recent conservative governments. Through this analysis, we will analyze the suitability of the appointments based on competence, political connection, and representativeness by adding or excluding factors considered by the previous studies.

III. Research Method and Framework

This study classifies the criteria for political appointments in Korea as competence, political connection, and representativeness based on the previous research (Wyszommirski, 1989: 45-73; Kim, 1996; Kim, 2001; Bae and Min, 2003; Cha and Cho, 2013). Presidents consider these three different criteria to appoint minister and vice-minister because of following reasons. First, presidents must consider the competence of political appointees to ensure the success of their policy (Aberbach, and Rockman, 2009). Second, however, presidents must pay particular attention to both their political party and political support base which are the consequence of the spoils system (Aberbach, and Rockman, 2009). Third, presidents must consider representative bureaucracy which suggests a more responsive and democratic public administration is formed when government personnel have characteristics reflecting the population as a whole (Bertelli and Feldmann, 2007). The specific research methods are following.

Table 1. The Analysis Framework for the Criteria for the Appointment of Ministers and Vice-Ministers

The criteria for appointment of political appointees	Specifics
Competence	Major career, Job relevancy, Academic background, Studying abroad, State examination
Political Connection	The member of the Commission on Presidential Transition, Same political party, Affiliated college
Representativeness	Birthplace and Gender

First, we will use major career, job relevancy, academic background, studying abroad, and state examination to assess whether ministers and vice-ministers have been appointed according to their competence or not. Major careers include bureaucrat, politician, military, legal profession, external expert, and other. Then we will attempt to compare between political executives' major career and their ministries of government for analyzing job relevancy. Lee Myung-bak government had fifteen ministries and Park Geun-hye government has seventeen ministries. Also, we will consider academic background by bachelor's degree, master's degree, and doctor's degree, but except high school diploma. Some previous research considered the high school diploma but there is no one with the diploma in the two administrations. As political appointees' academic background is generally high, we need to examine how many political appointees with MA or Ph.D. went abroad to study. Lastly, the state examination is a useful way to check the competence of political appointees. The examinations include bar exam, civil service examination, foreign service examination, and technology examination.

Second, we will examine political connection and one's affiliated college to explore whether a president applied other particular criteria for political appointments rather than competence of political appointees. To assess whether the appointees have a political connection with president or not, we collected the information about the members of the commission on presidential transition and the affiliated political party. We also categorized appointee's affiliated college as Seoul National University, Yonsei University, Korea University, universities located in Seoul, local universities, and military academies.

Third, we will analyze collected information about birthplace and gender of political appointees to assess regional representativeness and gender balance. The birthplaces were divided into Seoul metropolitan area, Chungcheong area, Yeongnam area, Honam area, Gangwon-do, Jeju-do, and North Korea. To explore whether gender balance was adjusted or not, we compared the total number of men and women in the each government and then specified which ministries have female appointees.

We will deal with these three criteria for the appointment of political appointees including ministers and vice-ministers by using the research framework. If a name of ministry is changed but the minister or vice-minister keep their role in the changed ministry, we will count the political appointee only one time. However, when a vice-minister is newly appointed as minister or the second vice-minister is newly appointed as the first vice-minister,

we will count the political appointees respectively. In this study, we will also focus only the recent conservative governments from February 2008 to January 2016.

IV. Findings

In this section, several social background variables (major career, job relevancy, academic backgrounds, studying abroad, state examinations, political connections, university, birthplace, gender of political appointees (ministers and deputy-ministers) will be analyzed during the Lee and Park Administrations.

4-1. Major Careers

We categorize the major careers of ministers and vice-ministers into bureaucrats, politicians, military, legal professions, experts including professors, researchers, and medical doctors, and other to examine their competence by comparing ministerial responsibility with their backgrounds. In this analysis, the major career is represented by the minister's the longest career. When we look at Table 2, we can find bureaucrats had the highest percentage of major careers at 39.13% in the Lee Myung-bak Administration. In the Park Geun-hye Administration, bureaucrats also have the second highest percentage of major careers at 32.50% and are slightly lower than the percentage of experts. It indicates that senior government officials have a higher chance of becoming ministers compared with those from other careers (Hahm, Jung, and Lee, 2012). This tendency continues from the Chun Doo Hwan administration but the percentage has been steadily declining. The reason why the former bureaucrats who are so-called internal experts have been occupying ministership is that they are considered prepared for ministerial positions. In particular, their experience is important when presidents try to effectively manage and control government ministries (Jung, Moon, and Hahm, 2008). It is also related to the elite power structure in Korea. Bureaucrats' education level and critical role in the process of rapid economic development prepares them to be easily recruited by a president (Hahm, Jung, Lee, 2012). External experts (32.61%) came second in Lee's administration and, in Park's administration, they are ranked first. Some university professors have been involved in politics and presidents have appointed them to ministerial positions to use their expertise and political professionalism (Jung, Moon, and Hahm, 2008). The professors also have an advantage at confirmation hearings compared to other careers in that they have relatively simple resumes (Hahm, Jung, and Lee, 2012). All Ministers of National Defense have been working in the military, every Minister of Justice has been recruited from legal profession, and Ministers of Foreign Affairs and Trade were entirely composed of diplomats in both administrations. When we consider bureaucrats and experts are about 70% of ministers in both administrations, we conclude that ministers have competence for their role regarding their major career backgrounds.

Table 2. Major Career Background of Ministers

Administration	Bureaucrat	Politician	Military	Legal profession	Expert	Other	Total
Lee Myung-bak	18 (39.13)	3 (6.52)	3 (6.52)	3 (6.52)	15 (32.61)	4 (8.70)	46 (100)
Park Geun-hye	13 (32.50)	3 (7.50)	2 (5.00)	6 (15.00)	15 (37.50)	1 (2.50)	40 (100)

(Percentage in parenthesis)

When we look at Table 3, we can find bureaucrats placed first as vice-ministers and the ratio of them is higher than 70 percent in the two administrations. Usually, in the case of appointing vice-ministers, bureaucrats are appointed as they are promoted (Park, 2011). When comparing these vice-minister's major careers in both governments, we find that Lee's administration appointed more bureaucrats than Park's but external expert rates in Park's administration is higher than that of Lee's. However, the vice-ministers of both administrations have competence to perform their roles and bureaucrats and external experts account for higher than 85 percent of major careers.

Table 3. Major Career Background of Vice-Ministers

Administration	Bureaucrat	Politician	Military	Legal profession	Expert	Other	Total
Lee Myung-bak	76 (81.72)	1 (1.08)	1 (1.08)	4 (4.30)	7 (7.53)	3 (4.30)	93 (100)
Park Geun-hye	44 (73.33)	0	2 (3.33)	4 (6.67)	8 (13.33)	2 (3.33)	60 (100)

However, it is difficult to determine whether the political appointees of these two administrations have competence as ministers and vice-ministers just by looking at their major careers. Their role as a ministers or vice-ministers should be related to their career to perform their work well. So we will try to examine the job relevancy of political appointees with their ministry.

4-2. Job relevancy

To assess the political appointee's job relevancy with their ministries we will consider every ministry of Lee and Park's administrations. We narrow it down to major career which indicates their longest career; whether the minister has job relevancy with his or her ministry. In the case of civil servants, we link their longest experience in the government ministry to the ministries where they are appointed as minister or vice-minister. However, we make an exception of one vice-minister in Lee's administration who had worked at the Ministry of Gender Equality since the ministry was established one year previously though his longest career was an administrative official.

First, Lee Myung-bak's government had fifteen ministries. Table 3 shows job relevancy of political appointees including both ministers and vice-ministers with their ministries in the Lee Myung-bak Administration. From Table 3, we can find that ministers from the Ministries of Foreign Affairs and Trade, Justice, Land, Transport and Maritime Affairs, National Defence have 100 percent of job relevancy with their ministries. Eight out

fifteen governmental ministries such as Education, Science and Technology, Employment and Labor, Environment, Foreign Affairs and Trade, Justice, Land, Transport and Maritime Affairs, Strategy and Finance, Unification have complete job relevancy with their vice-ministers. However, unfortunately, ministers from the Ministry of Environment had never worked in related fields.

Table 4. Political Appointees' Job Relevancy within the Ministry during Lee's Administration

Ministry	Minister			Vice-Minister		
	Job relevancy	N/A	Total 46 (100)	Job relevancy	N/A	Total 93 (100)
Culture	2 (66.64)	1 (33.33)	3 (100)	3 (37.50)	5 (62.50)	8 (100)
Education, Science and Technology	1 (33.33)	2 (66.64)	3 (100)	9 (100)	0	9 (100)
Employment and Labor	3 (75.00)	1 (25.00)	4 (100)	3 (100)	0	3 (100)
Environment	0	2 (100)	2 (100)	3 (100)	0	3 (100)
Food, Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries	3 (75.00)	1 (25.00)	4 (100)	6 (75.00)	2 (25.00)	8 (100)
Foreign Affairs and Trade	2 (100)	0	2 (100)	9 (100)	0	9 (100)
Gender Equality and Family	2 (66.64)	1 (33.33)	3 (100)	1 ()	4 ()	5 (100)
Health and Welfare	1 (25.00)	3 (75.00)	4 (100)	3 (75.00)	1 (25.00)	4 (100)
Justice	3 (100)	0	3 (100)	4 (100)	0	4 (100)
Knowledge Economy	3 (75.00)	1 (25.00)	4 (100)	8 (88.89)	1 (11.11)	9 (100)
Land, Transport and Maritime Affairs	2 (100)	0	2 (100)	7 (100)	0	7 (100)
National Defense	3 (100)	0	3 (100)	1 (33.33)	2 (66.64)	3 (100)
Public Administration and Security	1 (33.33)	2 (66.64)	3 (100)	6 (66.67)	3 (33.33)	9 (100)
Strategy and Finance	2 (66.64)	1 (33.33)	3 (100)	9 (100)	0	9 (100)
Unification	1 (33.33)	2 (66.64)	3 (100)	3 (100)	0	3 (100)

Second, there were some changes in the ministries of Park Geun-hye from Lee's administration. More specifically, four ministries' names were changed and two ministries were divided into two ministries respectively. The name of some ministries was changed from Education, Science and Technology to Education; from Knowledge Economy to Trade; Industry and Energy; from Land, Transport and Maritime Affairs to Land; Infrastructure and Transport; and from Public Administration and Security to Government Administration and Home Affairs. The Ministry of Education, Science and Technology was divided into the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Science, ICT and Future Planning. The Ministry of Land, Transport and Maritime Affairs was also divided into the Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport and the Ministry of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries. Ministers who have worked in a field related to their appointed ministries are the following: Ministers of Culture, Employment and Labor, Environment, Food, Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Foreign Affairs and Trade, Justice, National Defense, Science, ICT and Future Planning,

Strategy and Finance, and Unification. Thirteen out of seventeen ministries are filled with vice-ministers who have job relevancy with their ministries.

Table 5. Political Appointees' Job Relevancy within the Ministry during Park's Administration

Ministry	Minister			Vice-Minister		
	Job relevancy	N/A	Total 40 (100)	Job relevancy	N/A	Total 60 (100)
Culture	2 (100)	0	2 (100)	5 (100)	0	5 (100)
Education	3 (75.00)	1 (25.00)	4 (100)	4 (100)	0	4 (100)
Employment and Labor	2 (100)	0	2 (100)	1 (50.00)	1 (50.00)	2 (100)
Environment	1 (100)	0	1 (100)	1 (100)	0	1 (100)
Food, Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries	1 (100)	0	1 (100)	1 (100)	0	1 (100)
Foreign Affairs and Trade	1 (100)	0	1 (100)	4 (100)	0	4 (100)
Gender Equality and Family	0	3 (100)	3 (100)	2 (100)	0	2 (100)
Government Administration and Home Affairs	2 (50.00)	2 (50.00)	4 (100)	3 (50.00)	3 (50.00)	6 (100)
Health and Welfare	2 (66.67)	1 (33.33)	3 (100)	2 (66.67)	1 (33.33)	3 (100)
Justice	2 (100)	0	2 (100)	4 (100)	0	4 (100)
Land, Infrastructure and Transport	2 (66.67)	1 (33.33)	3 (100)	5 (100)	0	5 (100)
Maritime Affairs and Fisheries	3 (75.00)	1 (25.00)	4 (100)	3 (100)	0	3 (100)
National Defense	2 (100)	0	2 (100)	2 (100)	0	2 (100)
Science, ICT and Future Planning	2 (100)	0	2 (100)	3 (60.00)	2 (40.00)	5 (100)
Strategy and Finance	3 (100)	0	3 (100)	6 (100)	0	6 (100)
Trade, Industry and Energy	1 (50.00)	1 (50.00)	2 (100)	5 (100)	0	5 (100)
Unification	2 (100)	0	2 (100)	2 (100)	0	2 (100)

4-3. Academic background

The academic background can be used to verify whether political appointees' competence is considered or not for the political appointment. Ministers with a doctor's degree have the highest ratio of academic backgrounds in both administrations, followed by master's degree and bachelor's degree. In the Park Geun-hye Administration, ministers who had a doctor's degree account for about sixty percent of all ministers and there were only two ministers with BA. Also, there is no one who was only a high school graduate, that is, every minister had at least bachelor's degree in both administrations.

Table 6. Academic Background of Ministers

Administration	High-school diploma	Bachelor's degree	Master's degree	Doctor's degree	Total
Lee Myung-bak	0	9 (19.57)	15 (32.61)	20 (43.48)	46 (100)
Park Geun-hye	0	2 (5.00)	15 (37.50)	23 (57.50)	40 (100)

Vice-ministers with a doctors' degree also represent the highest percentage of academic backgrounds in the governments, followed by Master's degree and Bachelor's degree. There is no vice-minister who only has high-school diploma in either the Lee or Park administrations. This phenomenon has lasted from the Park Chung-hee regime (Bae and Min, 2003).

Table 7. Academic Background of Vice-Ministers

Administration	High-school diploma	Bachelor's degree	Master's degree	Doctor's degree	Total
Lee Myung-bak	0	18 (19.35)	37 (39.78)	38 (40.86)	93 (100)
Park Geun-hye	0	7 (11.67)	26 (43.33)	27 (45.00)	60 (100)

4-4. Study Abroad

One of the features of the recent conservative administrations is many ministers studied abroad. Specifically, more than 50 percent of the ministers went abroad to study and ministers with a Ph.D. account for the largest proportion among ministers who studied abroad in both administrations. Comparing the two administrations' ratio of studying abroad, more ministers of Park's administration went abroad to study than those of Lee's administration. In Park's administration, three out of twenty four ministers who studied abroad graduated from University of Wisconsin.

Table 8. Ministers Studying Abroad

Administration	Applicable			N/A	Total
	Law School	MA	Ph.D.		
Lee Myung-bak	1 (2.17)	8 (17.39)	14 (30.43)	23 (50.00)	46 (100)
Park Geun-hye	0	9 (22.50)	15 (37.50)	16 (40.00)	40 (100)

Even in the case of vice-minister's studying abroad, the ratio is higher than 60 percent in both administrations. It can be related to the fact that seven out of ten vice-ministers are bureaucrats who can use useful systems provided for them like studying abroad on a government scholarship and leave of absence for studying abroad. In fact, more vice-ministers of Park's administration studied abroad than those of Lee's administration and more ministers in Park's administration went abroad to study than those of Lee's administration. Also, of the ministers in Park's administration who went abroad to study, four graduated from University of Wisconsin.

Table 9. Vice-Ministers Studying Abroad

Administration	Applicable			N/A	Total
	Law School	MA	Ph.D.		
Lee Myung-bak	0	38 (40.86)	18 (19.35)	37 (39.78)	93 (100)
Park Geun-hye	2 (3.33)	25 (41.67)	15 (25.00)	18 (30.00)	60 (100)

4-5. State examination

The state examination can also be utilized as a competence factor for political appointments. Ministers drawn from state examinations represent more than 50 percent of all ministers. The Civil Service Examination has the highest percentage of state examination graduates in both administrations. In Park's administration, ministers from the Bar Examination (20.00%) are in a higher proportion to those of Lee's administration.

Table 10. State Examination of Ministers

Administration	Bar Examination	Civil Service Examination	Foreign Service Examination	Technology Examination	N/A	Total
Lee Myung-bak	3 (6.52)	16 (34.78)	3 (6.52)	1 (2.17)	23 (50.00)	46 (100)
Park Geun-hye	8 (20.00)	12 (30.00)	1 (2.50)	1 (2.50)	18 (45.00)	40 (100)

Vice-ministers drawn from state examinations went on to become more than 85 percent of all ministers. This result is also related to the fact that vice-ministers are usually appointed from bureaucrats by promotion (Park, 2011). The vice-ministers, rated from the highest to lowest amount, are graduates of the Civil Service Examination, Bar Examination, Foreign Service Examination, and Technology Examination in both administrations. In the Lee Myung-bak Administration, one who only passed Grade 7 Civil Servant Examination was appointed as vice-minister. This vice-minister has a connection to the President Lee Myung-bak in that she had worked as civil servant in Seoul City Hall and was a Member of the Commission on Presidential Transition.

Table 11. Vice-Ministers' Participation in State Examinations

Administration	Bar exam	Civil Service Examination	Foreign Service Examination	Technology Examination	N/A	Total
Lee Myung-bak	8 (8.60)	66 (70.97)	4 (4.30)	1 (1.08)	14 (15.05)	93 (100)
Park Geun-hye	4 (6.67)	36 (60.00)	4 (6.67)	5 (8.33)	11 (18.33)	60 (100)

4-6. Political Connection

We considered whether a political appointee is a member of the Commission on Presidential Transition, or is affiliated with the same party as the President, to explore a political connection between a minister and the President which could affect the political appointment. When a member of the Commission on Presidential Transition joined the same political party as the President, we count the political appointee only one time in the category of the Commission on Presidential Transition. This is because the fact that an appointee is a member or not can indicate that the political appointee has more direct relations with the President.

Table 12 shows that ministers who have a political connection to either President are more than 35 percent of the total of political appointees from both governments. In Lee's administration, there were three times more Commission members as compared with ministers in same party as the President. On the other hand, in the Park Geun-hye administration, there is no significant difference between the number of ministers who were members of the Commission on Presidential Transition and members of same party.

Table 12. Political Connection between Minister and President

Administration	Political Connection		N/A	Total
	The Commission on Presidential Transition	Same Party		
Lee Myung-bak	13 (28.26)	4 (8.70)	29 (63.04)	46 (100)
Park Geun-hye	6 (15.00)	8 (20.00)	26 (65.00)	40 (100)

When we compare the ministers with vice-ministers, the percentage of political connection for vice-ministers is much less than that of ministers'. This result is also related to the fact that generally vice-ministers are recruited from bureaucrats (Park, 2011). It suggests that vice-minister appointments seem more reasonable in that the appointment is further away from any political connection with the President. However, in the case of vice-ministers, both administrations show a greater percentage of political connection through membership of the Commission than being in the same party, although this is not significant.

Table 13. Political Connection between Vice-Minister and President

Government	Political Connection		N/A	Total
	The Commission on Presidential Transition	Same Party		
Lee Myung-bak	10 (10.75)	1 (1.08)	82 (88.17)	93 (100)
Park Geun-hye	5 (8.33)	1 (1.67)	54 (90.00)	60 (100)

4-7. Political appointees' affiliated college

In Korea, school ties are still an important factor for relationships between people. So we tried to research the universities which ministers and vice-ministers graduated from to assess how much school ties affect political appointments. In both administrations, the largest proportion of ministers graduated from Seoul National University. Graduates from the top three universities including Seoul National University, Yonsei University, and Korea University are in favourable positions to become ministers. This is because those who pass the state examination for becoming a senior government official have been mostly graduates from these three universities (Hahm, Jung, and Lee, 2012). These three universities have also been major suppliers for outside experts like professors, researchers, and medical doctors, politicians, and lawyers (Hahm, Jung, and Lee, 2012). Eighty-five percent of the ministers from both administrations graduated from the top three universities or the other universities in Seoul. Interestingly, of the local universities, all but one of the ministers graduated from universities located in the Youngnam area which is birthplace of both presidents. There is no minister who graduated from a university in Choongchung, Gangwon, and Jeju. Every

minister who was appointed in the Ministry of National Defence graduated from the Military Academy.

Table 14. Minister's Affiliated College

Administration	Seoul National University	Yonsei University	Korea University	University in Seoul	Local University	Military Academy	Total
Lee Myung-bak	24 (52.17)	5 (10.87)	6 (13.04)	5 (10.87)	3 (6.52)	3 (6.52)	46 (100)
Park Geun-hye	20 (50.00)	7 (17.50)	2 (5.00)	5 (12.5)	4 (10.00)	2 (5.00)	40 (100)

In both administrations, ministers that graduated from Seoul National University make up a higher percentage than those from other universities. More than 80 percent of ministers of both administrations were drawn from universities located within Seoul. Although twelve out of fourteen ministers graduated from local universities located in the Youngnam area in the Lee Myung-bak Administration, graduates from universities in Youngnam, Choongchung, and Honam areas were equally appointed as vice-ministers in the Park Geun-hye Administration. Thus we can find that President Park's appointments with regard to political appointees from local universities have a more demographic balance than President Lee's vice-minister appointments.

Table 15. Vice-Ministers' Affiliated College

Administration	Seoul National University	Yonsei University	Korea University	University in Seoul	Local University	Military Academy	Total
Lee Myung-bak	38 (40.86)	8 (8.60)	15 (16.13)	16 (17.20)	15 (16.13)	1 (1.08)	93 (100)
Park Geun-hye	26 (43.33)	7 (11.67)	4 (6.67)	14 (23.33)	7 (11.67)	2 (3.33)	60 (100)

When we consider both ministers and vice-ministers' affiliated universities, at the time of Lee's administration there was a higher percentage of graduates from Korea University than Park's. We assume that it is related to President Lee's affiliation with Korea University. In particular, in Park's administration, one minister and four vice-ministers were appointed that were graduates from Sungkyunkwan University.

4-8. Birthplace

We can assess the regional representativeness of a political executive through his or her birthplace. Both Lee's birthplace which is Pohang and Park's birthplace which is Daegu are located in the Youngnam area. In Lee's administration, those who are from the Youngnam area dominated ministerial positions and have the second largest proportion of the positions in the Park's administration. This tendency of the Youngnam area to dominate the Korean political system has continued from the President Park Chung-hee Administration for more than 40 years (Hahm, Jung, Lee, 2012). There seems to be a strong relationship

between the high percentage of ministers born in Youngnam and its being the birth place of Lee and Park. In both administrations, in particular, three areas including Honam, Gangwon, and Jeju have been less represented.

Table 16. Ministers' Birthplace

Administration	Seoul metropolitan area	Chungcheong	Yeongnam area	Honam area	Gangwon	Jeju	North Korea	Total
Lee Myung-bak	12 (27.66)	6 (12.77)	15 (31.91)	6 (12.77)	4 (8.51)	1 (2.13)	2 (4.26)	46 (100)
Park Geun-hye	15 (37.50)	5 (12.50)	13 (32.50)	5 (12.50)	2 (5.00)	0	0	40 (100)

In the Lee Myung-bak Administration, the Youngnam area has the highest percentage of vice-minister's birthplaces which is double that of the Seoul metropolitan area (20.65%). Unlike Lee's administration, in Park Geun-hye's administration, the Choongchung area (23.33%) is overrepresented and Honam area is less represented.

Table 17. Vice-Ministers' Birthplace

Administration	Seoul metropolitan area	Chungcheong area	Yeongnam area	Honam area	Gangwon	Jeju	North Korea	Total
Lee Myung-bak	19 (20.43)	15 (16.13)	39 (41.94)	17 (18.28)	3 (3.23)	0	0	93 (100)
Park Geun-hye	19 (31.67)	14 (23.33)	15 (25)	9 (15.00)	2 (3.33)	1 (1.67)	0	60 (100)

4-9. Gender

The other criterion to assess representativeness is ministers' gender. Women are much less represented in that only about ten percent of ministers in both administrations are female. In Lee's administration, women were appointed as ministers in the Ministry of Gender Equality and Family and the Ministry of Health, Welfare and Environment. In Park's administration, female ministers are affiliated in Gender Equality and Family and Ministry and Maritime Affairs and Fisheries. It seems that there was a lower interest in gender policy in Lee's administration in that the Ministry of Gender Equality and Family was contracted as Ministry of Gender Equality (Cha and Cho, 2013). Even, the percentage of female ministers in Park's administration is less than Lees'. These figures are different from the pledges of both presidents who had promised to expand women's role by appointing female political appointees. One common denominator of both administrations is every Minister of Gender Equality is a woman.

Table 18. Ministers' Gender

Administration	Man	Woman	Total
Lee Myung-bak	40 (86.96)	6 (13.04)	46 (100)
Park Geun-hye	36 (90.00)	4 (10.00)	40 (100)

Table 18 suggests that women also are less represented in vice-ministries. In detail, less than 6 percent of vice-ministers are female. It means women are less represented in vice-ministries as well as ministries. The only female minister of the Lee Myung-bak Government worked in the Ministry of Health and Welfare. Three female vice-ministers of Park's administration were in the Ministry of Health and Welfare, the Ministry of Gender Equality and Family and the Ministry of Employment and Labor.

Table 19. Vice-Minister's Gender

Administration	Man	Woman	Total
Lee Myung-bak	92 (98.92)	1 (1.08)	93 (100)
Park Geun-hye	57 (95.00)	3 (5.00)	60 (100)

V. Summary and Discussion

In this paper, we tried to analyse what is the criteria for ministers and vice-ministers of the recent conservative governments by categorizing competence, nepotism, and representativeness. Table 20 shows criteria for the appointment of political appointees in the Lee Myung-bak Administration and Park Geun-hye Administration. First, we considered some factors such as major careers, job relevancy, academic backgrounds, studying abroad, and state examinations to verify political appointees' competence. In the case of major careers, internal experts who are bureaucrats including civil servants and diplomats and external experts including professors or researchers represent a large proportion of ministers and vice-ministers in both administrations. According to the job relevancy, most political appointees have been well matched with their ministries but the appointees to the Ministry of Gender Equality and Family had a lack of job relevancy in Lee Myung-bak Administration. In the Park Geun-hye Administration, both ministers and vice-ministers are better matched with their ministries than those of Lee's administration. When we consider political appointee's academic backgrounds, many appointees earned a master's degree or a doctor's degree and studied abroad. Also, many appointees passed state examinations; in particular, around 80 % of vice-ministers passed the exams. Second, we checked the political connection between political appointees and each President by focusing on membership of the Commission on Presidential Transition and the same party as the President. Ministers who participated in the Commission or joined the same party were about 30% but most vice-ministers have no obvious political connection. This is related to the former result that 8 out of ten vice-ministers are appointed from civil service bureaucrats. According to academic

factionalism, more than 60 percent of all political appointees as ministers and vice-ministers graduated from the top three universities including Seoul National University, Yonsei University, and Korea University. In the Lee Myung-bak Administration, a higher proportion of vice-ministers graduated from Korea University. Third, with regard to the representativeness of region and gender, the Youngnam area and men have been overrepresented in both administrations.

Table 20. Criteria for the Appointment of Political Appointees

Political Appointee		Minister		Vice-Minister	
Administration		Lee Myung-bak	Park Geun-hye	Lee Myung-bak	Park Geun-hye
Major Career	Bureaucrat	18 (39.13)	13 (32.50)	76 (81.72)	44 (73.33)
	Politician	3 (6.52)	3 (7.50)	1 (1.08)	0
	Military	3 (6.52)	2 (5.00)	1 (1.08)	2 (3.33)
	Judicial Officer	3 (6.52)	6 (15.00)	4 (4.30)	4 (6.67)
	Expert	15 (32.61)	15 (37.50)	7 (7.53)	8 (13.33)
	Others	4 (8.70)	1 (2.50)	4 (4.30)	2 (3.33)
	Total	46 (100)	40 (100)	93 (100)	60 (100)
Job Relevancy	Applicable	28 (60.87)	30 (75.00)	75 (80.65)	53 (88.33)
	N/A	18 (39.13)	10 (25.00)	18 (19.35)	7 (11.67)
	Total	46 (100)	40 (100)	93 (100)	60 (100)
Academic Background	Bachelor's degree	9 (19.57)	2 (5.00)	18 (19.35)	7 (11.67)
	Master's degree	15 (32.61)	15 (37.50)	37 (39.78)	26 (43.33)
	Doctor's degree	20 (43.48)	23 (57.50)	38 (40.86)	27 (45.00)
	Total	46 (100)	40 (100)	93 (100)	60 (100)
Studying Abroad	Applicable	23 (50.00)	24 (60.00)	56 (60.22)	42 (70.00)
	N/A	23 (50.00)	16 (40.00)	37 (39.78)	18 (30.00)
	Total	46 (100)	40 (100)	93 (100)	60 (100)
State Examination	Applicable	23 (50.00)	22 (55.00)	79 (84.95)	49 (81.67)
	N/A	23 (50.00)	18 (45.00)	14 (15.05)	11 (18.33)
	Total	46 (100)	40 (100)	93 (100)	60 (100)
Political Connection	Applicable	17 (36.96)	14 (35.00)	11 (11.83)	6 (10.00)
	N/A	29 (63.04)	26 (65.00)	82 (88.17)	54 (90.00)
	Total	46 (100)	40 (100)	93 (100)	60 (100)
University	Seoul National University	24 (52.17)	20 (50.00)	38 (40.86)	26 (43.33)
	Yonsei University	5 (10.87)	7 (17.5)	8 (8.60)	7 (11.67)
	Korea University	6 (13.04)	2 (5.00)	15 (16.13)	4 (6.67)
	University in Seoul	5 (10.87)	5 (12.5)	16 (17.20)	14 (23.33)
	Local University	3 (6.52)	4 (10.00)	15 (16.13)	7 (11.67)
	Military Academy	3 (6.52)	2 (5.00)	1 (1.08)	2 (3.33)
	Total	46 (100)	40 (100)	93 (100)	60 (100)
Birthplace	Seoul Metropolitan	12 (26.09)	15 (37.50)	19 (20.43)	19 (31.67)
	Chungcheong	6 (13.04)	5 (12.50)	15 (16.13)	14 (23.33)
	Kyungsang	15 (32.61)	13 (32.50)	39 (41.94)	15 (25.00)

	Chollar	6 (13.04)	5 (12.50)	17 (18.28)	9 (15.00)
	Gangwon	4 (8.70)	2 (5.00)	3 (3.23)	2 (3.33)
	Jeju	1 (2.17)	0	0	1 (1.67)
	North Korea	2 (4.35)	0	0	0
	Total	46 (100)	40 (100)	93 (100)	60 (100)
Gender	Man	40 (86.96)	36 (90.00)	92 (98.92)	57 (95.00)
	Woman	6 (13.04)	4 (10.00)	1 (1.08)	3 (5.00)
	Total	46 (100)	40 (100)	93 (100)	60 (100)

VI. Conclusions

South Korea has a presidential system, which is a system of government where a head of government is also head of state and leads an executive branch that is separate from the legislative branch. Under a presidential system, the President is powerful and appoints many experts and his/her political allies for key government positions. In contrast, a parliamentary system is a system of democratic governance of a state in which the executive branch derives its democratic legitimacy from, and is held accountable to, the legislature (parliament). In countries with a parliamentary system, the Prime Minister usually selects ministers from elected representatives within the ruling party from both houses of Parliament. As parliamentarians usually had a career prior to being elected, often that career is reflected in the appointment, but not always. Ministerial posts are graded for importance and new ministers generally get "junior" appointments while experienced ministers gradually are promoted to the "senior" ministries.

Overall, during the recent conservative governments (the Lee Myung-bak Administration and Park Geun-hye Administration), many political appointees have been appointed. Internal and external experts mainly occupy the ministership and vice-ministership, most vice-ministers have job relevancy with their ministry, and many highly educated people who have at least a domestic or overseas MA degree were appointed. However, these two administrations cannot be free from some personnel problems like political connection between the appointee and the relevant President. Graduates from some particular universities both domestic and abroad, are overrepresented. Some regions are underrepresented, while others are overrepresented. Noticeably, the male gender dominates. Also, in the case of ministership, those who have worked in the related field are needed to be appointed as ministers. As a result, although competence or professionalism is an important criterion of political appointment, both presidents should be criticized for their patronage system. Also, these results show that they broke or fudged on their campaign promises to nominate and recruit competent people without considering their gender, region, university, and political orientation.

Although political appointees occupy diverse key positions and constitute the heart of civilian leadership in government over the years (Kim, 2009), personnel practices for political appointees have not been professionally handled (Kim, 2004). The problematic results also came from this being poorly institutionalized. There are some recommendations for political appointments to overcome those problems caused by the patronage system.

First, the government needs to establish ‘a quality national talent data bank’ where talented people can be recommended not only by a closely-knit group of powerful insiders but by various government offices or outsiders and themselves. The government needs to manage and use the collected data for political appointments independently from the intelligence power (Kim, 2004). We expect this bank can be expected to be helpful for collecting excellent personnel.

Second, government needs to make a broad and proactive system which searches, evaluates, and selects candidates in personnel procedures to place ‘the right person and in the right post at the right time’ (Kim, 2004). Although the Park Geun-hye Administration revived the Senior Secretary to the President for Personnel Affairs to recommend pre-verified and talented people, the Park administration failed to select the most suitable person for a vacancy. Therefore, the administration needs to devise a more effective system for political appointments.

Third, the government needs to make a transparent recruitment and appointment system. Although political appointees have enormous influence on national policies, the process and methods of selecting them are always veiled (Kim, 2009). Not only is the President making a “personal” decision for political appointments but also citizens are deeply cynical about political appointments. To implement this recommendation, the President needs a break from the imperial notion that the President has a right over all personnel matters for political appointees (Kim, 2004). In other words, well-functioning “institutional” presidency is needed in South Korea.

References

- Aberbach, Joel D., and Rockman, Bert A. (2009). The appointments process and the administrative presidency. *Presidential Studies Quarterly*, 39(1): 38-59.
- Bae, Byeong Yong, and Min, Byoung-Ik. (2003). The Criteria and Characteristics of Korean Governments’ Appointing Vice-Ministers from Rhee Seung Man Government to Kim Dae Jung Government. *Korea Public Administration Journal*, 12(3): 241-273.
- Bertelli, Anthony, and Feldmann, Sven E. (2007). Strategic appointments. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 17(1): 19-38.
- Cha, Woowon, and Cho, Joon-Tag. (2013). A comparative study on the presidential personnel management : Focusing on the social background of presidential secretaries. *The Korea Public Administration Journal*. 22(3): 347-386.
- Hahm, Sung Deuk, Jung, Kwangho, and Lee, Sam Youl. (2013). Exploring the determinants of the entry and exit of ministers in Korea: 1980–2008. *Governance*, 26(4): 657-675.
- Jung, Kwangho, Moon, M. Jae, and Hahm, Sung Deuk. (2008). Exploring the Linkage Between Ministerial Leadership and Performance in Korea. *Administration and Society*.
- Kim, Ho-Gyun. (2002). A Study on the role of Korean Ministers: focusing on the minister appointment criteria. *Korea Public Administration Journal*, 11(1): 3-28.

- Kim, Pan Suk. (2004). Presidential personnel innovation for Presidential appointees in Korea: toward an institutional Presidency. *Public Administration and Development*, 24(3): 235-246.
- Kim, Pan Suk. (2009). A case for performance management for political appointees. *Public Personnel Management*, 38(4): 1-18.
- Kim, Soon Yang. (1996). A Study on the Selection Criteria of political Appointees in Social Welfare Departments. *Korean Public Administration Review*, 30(1): 1017-1033.
- Ha, Young Ae. (2015). Research on Female Ministers in Korea: With the Focus on Appointments and Roles. *Journal of Parliamentary Research*. 10(1): 297-330.
- Lee, See-Won, and Min, Byoung-Ik. (2002). Incumbency and Social Background of the Ministers in Korean Governments. *The Korea Public Administration Journal*. 11(3): 53-82.
- Lee, See-Won and Min, Byoung-Ik. (2010). The Characteristics of Shuffling Ministers in Korean Government. *Korean society and public administration*. 21(1): 49-74.
- Min, Byoung-Ik. (2006). The Regional Representation of Ministers and Vice-Ministers in Korea. *Social Science Research Review*, 22(1): 63-89.
- Mosca, G. (1963). *The Ruling Class*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Park, Young-Won. (2011). The Empirical Study on Appointment Balance of Political Executive. *Korean Public Personnel Administration Review*. 10(3): 239-257.
- Sung, Sea Young. (2014). Determinants of the Ministerial Resignations in South Korean Cabinet, 1948-2013. *Korean society and public administration*. 25(1): 95-114.
- Sung, Sea Young. (2015). Length of Ministerial Tenure in Korea. *Korean Public Administration Review*. 49(3): 427-451.