

STAKEHOLDERS' PARTICIPATION IN TOURISM DEVELOPMENT: A SUSTAINABLE APPROACH

Margarita G. Hilario, Author

Orlino J. Mandac, Contributor

Faculty of the College of Business, Economics and Accountancy

And MMSU Graduate School

DPA Students, University of Northern Philippines

E-mail: margaritahilario@yahoo.com

Tourism is an important aspect of local economic development. The booming tourism industry in the province created new and more direct jobs as evidenced from the growth of travel agency, food industry, accommodation industry and other tourism-related business establishments.

This study was conducted to determine if stakeholders' participation is being practiced in local governance especially in the area of tourism promotion and development. Specifically, it aimed to determine the level of awareness and involvement of various stakeholders such as the private sector businesses, NGOs/POs, local community represented by the ordinary citizens, barangay chairs, youth and women's group and the educational and training bodies in the formulation and implementation of tourism programs, projects and activities of the provincial government of Ilocos Norte.

The researchers made use of variety of tool to get the holistic view of the tourism industry in the province. This include **document analysis** on pertinent documents like the Tourism Master Plan, Socio-Economic Profile of the Province 2012, existing tourism laws such as legislative acts and ordinances supportive to the development thrust of the province. Data gathered were reinforced through an **in depth structured and unstructured interview** to representatives of various stakeholders.

Generally, it was found out that the level of awareness of all types of stakeholders on the tourism development efforts of the PGIN is high though in terms of involvement in the formulation of plans, programs and activities, it is at **moderate level** among **NGOs/POs**, the private sector and local community. The educational and training bodies obtained high level of involvement in some areas such as marketing communication, product and market development, trade fair and exhibits and environmental management. Data also manifest low involvement among local community. Results show that local government leaders need to expand and engaged more of the local residents to encourage wider participation, after all, majority of those who were interviewed, either individually or in focus group discussion shared significant insights in the promotion of tourism development of the province at large.

As regards to implementation of tourism programs and activities, it was found out that the level of involvement of various groups is varied. The local community have low level of involvement in all aspects of tourism development. NGO's/POs and the academic community appeared to be at moderate level. It is noteworthy to mention that the business sector is supportive to the thrust of the PGIN which is geared towards tourism development as evidenced by the high level of participation in the implementation of plans. However, the one respondent said that the provincial government has all the resources in the execution of plans especially when it comes to tourism.

In terms of the acceptance on the roles associated in each type of stakeholders, majority expressed their commitment to assume their part. There are only two respondents from the local community who said that planning is done by the concerned authorities from the local community

Collaborative leadership through stakeholders' participation in the administration of tourism programs and services are manifested in the leadership style of the Chief Executive of the Province. According to the respondents, both internal (employees from the PGIN) and outsiders' point of view, the governor is the very open to suggestions. This claim was strengthened by the words of the President of Filipino-Chinese Chamber of Commerce, he said *"you don't need to ask whether she is a practitioner of collaborative leadership or not", it is shown in her way of administering the provincial government"*. This was confirmed by various stakeholders who were interviewed in this study.

Sustainability of tourism is attributed with strong leadership and participation of stakeholders, from planning to implementation processes. More and more jobs continue to create if tourism is sustained which will result to gainful employment, thus, making local residents enjoy decent living. The ultimate goal of national and local government which is inclusive growth is possible.

With these findings, it is recommended that the role of the community must be strengthened. The private sectors, the *NGOs/POs* and educational and training bodies must continue supporting the thrust of the present administration. In conclusion, tourism industry in *IlocosNortecan* be sustained through strong collaboration and commitment among different stakeholders.

Introduction

Tourism has been noted as one of the world's fastest growing industries and recognized as a major source of income for many countries in the world since it attracts investments and generate employment opportunities. The nature of the industry is people-oriented, hence, it is expected that it can help revitalise economies through employment generation. The contribution of tourism to economic development has encouraged countries like the Philippines to pursue this highly promising industry. To date, tourism is among the top contributors of the Philippine economy.

Realizing the potentials of tourism in creating employment and alleviating poverty in the province, the Provincial Government of *IlocosNorte* (PGIN) led by *Governor Imee R. Marcos* has massively improved the said industry. The Tourism Master Plan became the roadmap of all the initiatives and efforts on tourism promotions which envisions to **“Build IlocosNorte as a Foremost Tourist Destination of the North”**. Presently, the PGIN is engaged in various tourism development and promotion programs and activities all-year round with emphasis on the highly institutionalized programs like *Tan-ok ni Ilocano Festival* of all Festivals - a dance showdown showcasing the rich Ilocano culture and tradition, *La Virgen Milagrosa Provincial Fiesta*, and the *Himalasa Buhangin*, the biggest outdoor arts and music festival in the north! to name just a few.

IlocosNorte has a lot to offer...It is blessed with many man-made and natural tourist attractions. The combination of coastal resources and the rich heritage sites in the province make *IlocosNorte* more unique than any other province in the country. Among the mostly visited natural tourist destination in the province are: *Pagudpud* which is famous for its white sand beaches, the sand dunes in *Paoay* and other natural attractions plus the historical landmarks such as the *Paoay Church* and the *Juan Luna Shrine*. Further, province also takes pride of its Ilocano cuisine and innovative products like the *miki*, *pinakbet*, *tinupig*, *bagnet*, *longanisa*, etc.

Indeed, *IlocosNorte* has great tourism potential to heritage and cultural tourism to adventure, culinary, sports, ecological, *agri-tourism* and even sacred tourism. To achieve the gains of this promising industry, the PGIN took advantage of the rich resources and opportunities of tourism as strategy to eradicate poverty and to achieve the **IN2020 Vision “Pasingked anti Kinatan-ok ni Ilocano!**, in English **“ Making Ilocos Norte Great Again”**.

Evidently, these activities have drawn tourists, both local and foreign to take part on those significant events. Considerably, *IlocosNorte* became the favourite firm production destination, starting off from the classic Filipino film *“Himala”* and various Hollywood pictures.

In support to tourism, the PGIN is engaged in **enterprise development programs** to upgrade *Ilocos* best products through technical skills training, product and market development and participation in local and international exhibits. Other indispensable components of tourism

development are environmental management and infrastructure development which are also evident in their strategic plan and day to day activities of the PGIN.

With the great potential of tourism and the expected impact to economy which can be seen through the creation new and more direct jobs from the growth of travel agency, food industry, accommodation industry and other tourism-related business establishments and indirect jobs like tourists aids, tour guides, among others for local residents, the researchers believed that tourism in the province can achieved sustainability through **stakeholders participation in the formulation, implementation and evaluation of tourism programs and activities.**

According to World Tourism Organization, tourism is a multi-faceted activity. Many different stakeholders are potentially engaged in the sector or are affected by it, directly and indirectly. Some of the key stakeholders are the **private sector businesses, the local community, NGOs and educational bodies.** Each of these stakeholders have their own roles in the delivery of sustainable tourism.

Stakeholders participation or participatory governance is seen as a strategy for sustain development. It views governance as a **dynamic interaction between the government, business, and civil society organizations(CSOs) to formulate state policies, implement government programs projects and activities,** and ensure government transparency, accountability and citizens' participation. This approach became popular not only in other countries but also in the Philippines in various fields like governance in education, environment, disaster preparedness and mitigation, health and so much more.

The environment of public administration and governance in the 21st century is increasingly uncertain, complex and unpredictable. This is manifested by the intensifying global and ASEAN integration, climate change, technological advancement, cultural diversity and others that affected the capability of a nation in delivering social services such as health, education, environmental concerns, among others. These forces make governance more difficult as it challenge leaders and managers to take advantage of opportunities. To survive and prosper, this call for paradigm shift in governing action, a call for participatory governance or simply participation of multi stakeholders.

Sustainability is a growing trend in all aspects of governance and is now finding its way into tourism. The increasing popularity of sustainability has led to differing understandings of what sustainability really means, so this study help clarify the concept.

Statement of Objective

This study was conducted to find out how tourism development in the province can be sustained through the participation of stakeholders. Specifically, it aimed to determine the level of participation of various stakeholders of the tourism industry such as private sector businesses, local community, civil society organizations and educational bodies and institutions particularly in the formulation and implementation of the tourism development and promotions programs of local government of *Ilocos Norte*. It also seeks to determine the level of engagement of various stakeholders in achieving sustainable tourism by performing their respective roles in the administration of tourism programs.

Key Words

Stakeholders Participation refers to the involvement of various stakeholders in the formulation and implementation of tourism development and promotion program of local government

Sustainability refers to the capacity of the Local Chief Executives to engage stakeholders in tourism planning and implementation to sustain the various tourism programs and services of the government. It also means high involvement of stakeholders in the formulation and implementation of tourism programs.

Sustainable Approach is a strategy to sustain tourism development through active participation of stakeholders

Participatory Governance views governance as a dynamic interaction between government, business, and civil society organizations (CSOs) to formulate state policies, implement government programs projects and activities, and ensure government transparency, accountability and citizens' participation.

Stakeholders Roles and Relationships in Sustainable Tourism Development

Tourism is a **multi-faceted activity**. Many different stakeholders are potentially engaged in the sector or are affected by it, directly and indirectly. Table 1.1 identifies the main types of stakeholders and their roles in the delivery of sustainable tourism. Those same stakeholders might require assistance at various levels.

Stakeholder Type	Role in Delivering Sustainable Tourism
<u>Private Sector Businesses</u> Tourism Trade Associations Tourism Service Providers Tour Guide Association Foodproducers/establishment suppliers to the sector - Fast food houses Supermarket	<u>Private Sector Businesses</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Representation of, and influence on, the tourism sector - Operation of tourism services - Link to domestic and international markets - Product development, investment and improvement - Employment creation and generating local income - Reflecting economic, social and environmental sustainability issues in the development operations
<u>NGOs/POs</u> Environment and conservation NGOs Social and Community NGOs - Women's Organization - Youth Organization	<u>Role of NGOs/POs</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Representing different stakeholders interests - Engaging in strategic planning and development - Stakeholder coordination and supporting implementation - Capacity building and provision of expertise
<u>Educational and Training Bodies</u> Universities, colleges and teaching bodies Technical experts and advisory bodies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Knowledge gathering and dissemination - Supporting policy and strategy development - Capacity building and training - Specific Advice and expertise
<u>Local Community</u> - Barangay Councils - Individual Households	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Engaging in planning and decisions on tourism at a local level - Representing and communication local community interests - Pursuing equitable benefits sharing within communities - Interacting with tourists to mutual benefit - Reviewing income from tourist spending

Adapted from <http://www.e-unwto.org> IP Adress:180.194.29.22/May 19,2014

Conceptual Framework

Sustainable development, as a development paradigm is achieved in many ways. This study however is anchored with participatory governance model, a governance structure that seeks to bring stakeholders together to participate in the dialogue, decision making, and implementation of solutions to common problems or goals.

Government leaders and chief executives play significant contribution in tourism development. If local chief executives initiate programs, projects and activities that promote tourism, development is likely to occur. However, proactive leadership is not enough, local government efforts and initiatives must be supported with local government officials through the promulgation of relevant ordinances. Likewise, the education and training can take part in support to the tourism thrust of the province, this could be in terms of research and development, tourism promoters and advocates, marketing communication, trainers' to the local residents as co-advocates of tourism. The Non-Government Organizations (NGOs) is now seen as one of the biggest partner for growth and development. Different groups from the CSOs continue to rise to help the government in meeting sustainable goals. Other partner groups which is believed helpful in tourism development are the local community which includes like ordinary citizens, local bodies such as barangay officials. They are expected to exhibit responsible behaviour towards tourists in the community if empowered. The private sector businesses can also contribute in the furtherance of tourism in a certain area. Their influence on the tourism sector and operation of tourism services is instrumental in economic and social development through employment creation and generating local income.

If all stakeholders actively perform their roles from formulation to implementation of tourism programs and services, sustainable tourism is likely to occur. If tourism is sustained, employment is generated, poverty can be lessened.

Conceptual Paradigm



METHODOLOGY

Scope and Limitation of the Study

This study was limited to the stakeholders' level awareness and involvement in the formulation and implementation of tourism development and promotions programs and other support services initiated by the PGIN from 2010 up to present. The programs identified are based from the documents taken from the Provincial Tourism Office, the Communication and Media Office, Office of the *Ilocos Norte* Trade and Investment Center (INVEST), the official publication of the PGIN, *Paspas-Dur-as* and the PGIN website.

Data gathered involves the use of questionnaire, structured and unstructured interview and focused group discussion to four groups of respondents: the private sector businesses, local community, NGOs and the educational bodies and institutions.

Also, the stakeholders' engagement in pursuit of tourism development is limited to the roles identified by the United Nations World Tourism Organization(UNWTO).

Locale of the Study

This research study was conducted in the province of *Ilocos Norte* involving various stakeholders of the tourism industry such as the private sector businesses, the educational and training bodies, NGOs/POs and the local community from selected municipalities in the province.

Research Design

This research study is descriptive in nature as it deals with the determination of stakeholders' level of awareness of and involvement in the formulation and implementation of tourism programs, projects and activities of the Province of Ilocos Norte. Inspired by concept of stakeholders participation or participatory governance, an **unconventional approach in program administration, the researchers** wanted to find out if local leaders embrace collaborative leadership, that is NGO engagement, the business sector, local community and educational institutions in tourism planning and implementation of local government programs particularly at the provincial level.

Population and Sample of the Study

The respondents of this study are stakeholders consists of individuals, groups, or organization that have direct or indirect interest on tourism industry. It consists of four types:

Private Sector Businesses which includes suppliers to the tourism industry such as hotels, food establishments, retailing and communication services, travel agencies, tour guides, trade association and tour operators; **NGOs/PO** comprise the interest groups such as environmental/conservation and people's organization such as women's group and youth group; the **local community** which includes ordinary citizens and barangay officials; and the **Educational and Training Bodies** include faculty from HEIs and accredited trainers from the province. *Distribution of respondents is shown in Table 1.*

Table 1. Distribution of Respondents According to Stakeholder Type

Stakeholder Type	Frequency
<u>Private Sector Businesses</u>	
Tourism Service Providers <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Bakers and Restaurant Association of <i>IlocosNorte</i>(BRAIN) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>Saramsam, Macys Diner</i> 	2
Food producers/establishment suppliers to the sector <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mc Do/Jillibee) 	2
Hotel and Resort Association of Laoag and IlocosNorte (HARALIN)(Balayni Blas; Grand Octagon;Terra Rica;- PalomariApartel; Hotel Tifnny;Texicano Hotel; AA Travellers PAD	7
IlocosNorteAssociation of Travel Agencies <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - IlocandiaTravel and Tours - A&A Travel and Tours 	2
Tour Guide Association	3
Trade Association/Individual Businesses <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - President, Filipino-Chinese Chamber of Commerce, IN Chapter - <i>SaraboIlocandia, Victor Angels, JRS Express, Construction firm</i> 	5
Supermarket (Puregold/Savemore)	2
Communication Services(Sun cellular, Globe)	2
Subtotal	25
<u>NGOs/POs</u>	
Environment and Conservation Groups <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <i>Pinakbet Group, Badminton and Bikers Association</i> 	17
Social and Community NGOs (Women's Organization- Women in Development(WID)/Rural Improvement Club);	34

Youth Organization (<i>Sirib Ilocano Kabataan</i> Association(SIKA)	32
Subtotal	83
<u>Educational and Training Bodies</u> (Universities, colleges and teaching bodies, technical experts and advisory bodies)	15
<u>Local Community</u> (Community/Barangay Councils/Individual Households)	162
TOTAL	270

Data Gathering Procedure

To get a holistic view on the status of tourism in Ilocos Norte, the researcher wrote the governor thru the office of INVEST, Provincial Tourism Office and the Communication and Media Office. The documents gathered such as the Socio-Economic Profile 2012 and Tourism Master Plan served as basis in developing interview guide and questionnaire which were used during the data gathering.

Research Instrument

To elicit substantial first-hand information, the researchers made use of structured interview. To probe the data gathered, unstructured interview was adopted. Focused group discussion was also employed to gain more insights from the respondents.

Statistical Treatment of Data

The statistical tools used in the study are frequency counts and are given weights as follows: Low- 1; Moderate - 2; High – 3. Weighted mean scores were determined for the different respondents, and the weighted average means were tabulated and analysed.

The weighted average mean scores were interpreted using the following range:

Mean Range	Descriptive Interpretation
1.0 – 1.66	Low
1.67 -2.33	Moderate
2.34-3.00	High

RESULTS AND FINDINGS

One of the basic services of a provincial government as stipulated in the Philippine Local Government Code is tourism development and promotions program. The PGIN is engaged in various programs for such development of tourist attractions such as festivals and food to adventure and sports tourism, culture and heritage to eco-tourism. This is reinforced with an **Integrated Marketing Communication** program, with *PaoayKumakaway* as the province' tourism brand. In support to tourism, **enterprise development, environmental management and infrastructure development programs** were integrated as priority areas to achieve full potential to this broad and complex but promising industry.

The perceptions of the different stakeholders on tourism development and promotion efforts and initiatives of the provincial government is varied using the three indicators: awareness, formulation and implementation.

Stakeholders Level of Awareness and Involvement in the Formulation and Implementation of Tourism Development and Promotions Program of the Provincial Government of Ilocos Norte

Level of Awareness and Involvement of **Private Sector Businesses** in the Formulation and Implementation on the Tourism Development and Promotion Programs of PGIN

Awareness of Private Sector Businesses. From the business sector's point of view, the level of awareness on various initiatives of the PGIN on tourism **development and tourism promotions is high** as reflected in the overall mean scores of **3.63 (Table 2)**. Specifically, all tourism activities such as festivals, entertainment, cultural and heritage tourism, promotion of sports and eco – tourism obtained **high level of awareness**. This is expected since they are the providers of tourism services it is part of their strategy to discover opportunities from the tourism industry. It also implies that tourism programs of the PGIN are **communicated well to the private sector** particularly to the tourism service providers. This was affirmed by the respondents during the in-depth interview with owner-managers of travel agencies, hotels and restaurants, tour guides and managers of food establishments and even non-food businesses. Respondents were very spontaneous in saying that the PGIN had done much as far as tourism is concerned, in many aspects. The high level of awareness implies that the marketing communication program of PGIN which was dubbed as *PaoayKumakaoay* in 2012 is very effective as it reached wide coverage of audiences using various media such as social and outdoor media, the broadcast and print media, *PaspasDur-as*, an official radio program and publication of the PGIN, brochures, television ads and other touch points found elsewhere to reach all segments of the society.

Tourism can unleash its greatest potential if it is supported with business rules and regulations to protect the interests of stakeholders. Evidently, awareness of this aspect is high as shown by the mean score of 2.63. Respondents claimed during the interview that there is an existing investment code and expect for its full implementation the soonest. This implies that the tourism programs of the governor obtained full support from the local legislators. It must be noted that at the time the incumbent governor assumed its office in 2010, there were several ordinances passed in support to tourism as follows: the **P.O 042-2011**: An ordinance creating **tourism office** under the PGIN and **providing funds** therefore (**Republic Act 9593: Tourism Act of 2009**); **P.O 044 - 2011**: An ordinance creating the Communication and Media Office under the office of the governor, pursuant to section 486 of RA 7160 of the Local Government Code which serves to bring the provincial government closer to the people and in the process reawaken their consciousness to the need for continuing cooperation and coordination among all sectors of the community; **P.O 065 -12**: An ordinance enacting Ilocos Norte **Media Incentives of 2012** which is responsible for creating a data base for local services and utilities to be offered as media incentives and providing assistance and coordination of approved projects.

Despite the presence of these legislations, one respondent disclosed his dismay on the strength of internet connection among businesses which is believed an important component in the tourism industry especially so that the province caters to foreign tourists. He said that “*the communication provider needs to be more responsive to the demands of the tourists, hence supervision to communication service providers must take place*”.

In support to tourism, the PGIN also integrates Enterprise Development **Program**. Results show that respondents are **moderately** aware as manifested on the overall mean scores of **2.28**, however, specifically, respondents are highly aware on the skills training program, product and market development and trade exhibits of the province. This implies that the PGIN need to communicate if not strengthen the entrepreneurship programs to enhance local products to make them more competitive in the global market like the product development and market promotion, linkages and networking for broader product market.

Environmental Management is imperative in every endeavour. Evidently, the PGIN engages programs that protect and preserve the environment. Table 2 shows that respondents are **moderately aware** of the initiatives along this aspect as reflected on the mean score of 2.32 despite the fact that the PGIN is taking steps toward a greener and cleaner *Ilocos*. In fact, *Ilocos Norte* became once the frontier of green technology and the Cleanest and Greenest province in Region 1 and 1st runner-up in the Philippines. True to its commitment to the environment, the province has adopted green practices to limit dependence on fossil fuel and to pursue sustainable development. This implies that existing programs are not widely disseminated.

The PGIN also engaged in several **infrastructure development** projects like the face lifting of the province, the tourists centers, road widening and others. Level of awareness in this aspect is **high** as these are tangible projects of the province and the national government.

Table 2. Level of Awareness and Involvement in the Formulation and Implementation of Private Sector Businesses on the Tourism Development and Promotion Programs of PGIN
(Please see attached Table 2)

Involvement of Private Sector Businesses in the Formulation and Implementation of Tourism Programs

A closer look in **Table 2** revealed the extent of involvement of the private sector business in the **formulation process**. Interestingly, respondents are highly involved in tourism planning as proven by the **2.41 overall mean scores**. This was reinforced by the words of the president of a trade association disclosing that *“the governor wants first-hand information and meetings are called every now and then from various sectors including the hotel owners, the private sector and other groups”*.

Consistently, involvement in the **implementation** stage is **high (2.66)**. This high rating was confirmed by the respondents from the suppliers of tourism services who are most interested on the economic impact of tourism. In the interview, it was revealed that the role of the front liners in the tourism industry is very crucial. However, one *respondent said that the government has enough manpower and other resources to work for the activities*, however, the support is always there.

Awareness and Involvement of Local Community in the Formulation and Implementation of Tourism Development and Promotions Program of PGIN

Awareness of Local Community on Tourism Programs. The best representative to speak out the view of the local community are the barangay officials citizens who are bold enough to express their view. Result show that majority of the respondents are **highly aware** on the tourism activities and events since most are extensively advertised in social and outdoor media. A closer look at Table 3 reveals that local community partners are highly aware (2.4) on tourism programs, moderately aware in support activities such as enterprise development and environmental management with 2.2 and 2.1 mean scores respectively and high in the area of infrastructure development (2.4).

In the focused group discussion that was conducted to a group of people represented by chosen individuals who could best communicate the interest of the local community, most of them claimed that they are aware of the programs of the government. This is supported by the **high weighted mean scores** with high level of awareness in most areas, however, one respondent points out the importance of **effective traffic system, safe and security** as vital component of tourism development which were not found in the indicators. Another respondent said that to maximize the gains from the mobile seminar of government officials, a benchmarking activity of Local Government Units, there must be a re-echo to a larger group and a re-entry plan like the *Vietnam experience*.

Involvement of Local Community in the Formulation and Implementation of Tourism Development and Promotions Program of PGIN

Involvement of the local community in the planning **process is low**, however, there is high level of involvement in the implementation of several programs like participation in festivals, entertainment and marketing communication. This is manifested by the overwhelming support of the community during events like Tan-ok ni Ilocano Festival of all Festival with average of 150 people from each municipality participating.

As to support services like technical trainings on business management, incentives and market development and trade exhibits, the local community have moderate level of involvement in the implementation process.

Table 3. Awareness and Involvement of Local Community in the Formulation and Implementation of Tourism Development and Promotions Program of PGIN
(Please see attached Table)

Level of Awareness and Involvement of Non-Government Organizations (NGOs) in the Formulation and Implementation of Tourism Development and Promotion Programs of PGIN

Good governance, they say is the active interplay of the public sector, the private sector and the civil society organizations like NGOs. There are several sectors from the NGOs that are getting more active in government programs. These include environmental groups, women's group and youth group. Of the three groups, responses are varied as shown in **Table 4**.

Environmental Groups.Environmental protection and management has become a byword to many and advocacy to some. In the province of IlocosNorte, environmental and conservation groups like the *Pinakbet Group, the Badminton and Bikers Association* are active in the promotion of ecotourism activities.

The environmental groups have high level of awareness on the effort of the provincial government to develop tourism in the province. As to the involvement in the formulation and implementation of the programs, projects and activities, the ratings are moderate.

As a whole, the level of involvement of the environmental group on these programs is moderate, low in their involvement in the formulation of policies and program and moderate in the involvement in the implementation of the programs.

Programs to support tourism in the province like enterprise development, environmental management and infrastructure development programs are necessary to effectively achieve the goals of tourism development. This group of respondent obtain moderate level of awareness and involvement in the planning and implementation are at moderate level also

Youth Organization.Also, a representative from the youth group mentioned said in the interview that the governor is focusing on youth development as partners for local development. Accordingly, there are youth volunteers who are trained in many areas such as environmental protection, entrepreneurial development, among others. In an in- depth interview from representatives of *Sirib Ilocano Kabataan Association(SIKA)*, the largest volunteer youth group in IlocosNorte, the youth is taking the lead role in maintaining healthy environment. This is evidenced by the high level of awareness (2.74) and involvement in the implementation (2.36) of the different tourism programs as shown in **Table 4.1**.

A closer look in the table revealed that they are highly aware on the different support services such as enterprise development program(2.67), environmental management(2.78) and infrastructure development (2.69), however, formulation is generally low and implementation is at moderate level. Involvement in the planning however is low (1.45) since accordingly, the youth are tapped only in the execution of a program.

Women's/Social Group.Non-government organizations like the Women in Development (WID) and the Rural Improvement Club (RIC) of the province are getting more involved in the provincial government's effort along tourism.

The women's group have moderate level of awareness of the development of tourist attractions like festival, beach resorts, outdoor, eco-tourism programs as well as cultural and heritage programs 2.28 mean scores(Table 4.2). Likewise, level of awareness on the support services of the tourism programs of the province is at moderate level.

Similarly, women's group have moderate level of involvement in formulating and implementing tourism programs and activities of the province.

Likewise, the groups have moderate level of involvement in the formulation and implementation of the province's tourism programs and projects. Their level of awareness,

involvement in formulation of environmental management programs are high and moderate respectively and for infrastructure development, it is at moderate and low respectively.

Table 4 Level of Awareness and Involvement of Non-Government Organizations (NGOs) in the Implementation of Tourism Development and Promotion Programs of PGIN
(Please see attached table)

Level of Awareness and Involvement of Educational and Training Bodies in the Implementation of Tourism Development and Promotion Programs of PGIN

Awareness of Educational and Training Bodies on the Tourism Development and Promotion Programs of PGIN

The perspective of the educational and training bodies, which compose of academicians and accredited trainers in the Region were also noted. Generally, tourism programs, project and activities obtained **high level of awareness** as reflected by the weighted mean score of **2.56**. Specifically, marketing communication got the highest (2.8); followed by development of tourist attractions such as festivals, entertainment, leisure tourism (2.67) mean scores. The high level of awareness imply that the marketing communication tools used by the PGIN to promote tourism related activities is effective making it know to various segments particularly the educational institutions.

Involvement of Educational and Training Bodies in the Formulation and Implementation of Tourism Development and Promotion Programs of PGIN

A closer look at the **Table 5** revealed that involvement in the **formulation of plans is low (1.63)**, though at some point, in some of the tourism activities particularly on the marketing communication (1.93) and development of cultural and heritage tourism (1.73), participation is at moderate level. Accordingly, some faculty were invited when the *Tourism Master Plan* was developed. *She recalled that there were various groups present like NGOs, private sector and government officials.* This is an indication that somehow, there are consultations made during the tourism planning process but only to a **moderate extent**.

In terms of **implementation**, the **education institutions are moderately involved (1.93)**. This was supported by the respondents who said that there are invitations from the provincial government only on several events and activities. Spontaneously, respondents articulated their suggestions to fully engaged the educational institutions since their role is crucial in tourism

development like research and development activities, and as trainers for capacity building of stakeholders.

Table 5 Level of Awareness and Involvement of Educational and Training Bodies in the Implementation of Tourism Development and Promotion Programs of PGIN(Please see attached Table 5)

Stakeholders' Role in Delivering Sustainable Tourism

According to World Tourism Organization, tourism is a multi-faceted activity. Many different stakeholders are potentially engaged in the sector or are affected by it, directly and indirectly. Some of the key stakeholders are the **private sector businesses, the local community, NGOs and educational bodies**. Each of these stakeholders have their own roles in the delivery of sustainable tourism.

Role of Private Sector Businesses. Table 6 presents the view of the private sector on the expected role they perform in pursuit of sustainable tourism. Results is overwhelming as all respondents are willing to perform the following roles: first is to represent and influence on the tourism sector, operate tourism services; serve as a link to domestic and international markets; innovate product development, investment and improvement; employment creation and generating local income and to reflecting economic, social and environmental sustainability issues in the development operations. In an in-depth interview either individual or group discussion, all of them said they are willing to support to achieve full potential of this promising industry by performing the roles aforementioned.

Table 6. Roles Private Sector Businesses in Delivering Sustainable Tourism

Role of Private Sector Businesses	RESPONSES		
	Yes	No	Not Sure
Representation of, and influence on, the tourism sector	25	-	-
Operation of tourism services	25	-	-
Link to domestic and international markets	25	-	-
Product development, investment and improvement	25	-	-
Employment creation and generating local income	25	-	-

Reflecting economic, social and environmental sustainability issues in the development operations	25	-	-
	25	-	-
	25	-	-

Role of NGOs/POs.Expectedly,NGOs and POs are the best to represent different stakeholders’ interests, that is being instrumental to the sentiments of varied groups. Responses are varied, majority said yes in all items “*engaging in strategic planning and strategy development and stakeholder coordination and supporting implementation; capacity building and provision of expertise*” are also roles that they are willing to assume if given the opportunity. Few others said “no” and “not sure”

Table 7. Roles of NGOs (Environmental Group/ Women’s Group/ Youth Group) in Delivering Sustainable Tourism

Role of NGOs	RESPONSES(n=83)					
	YES		NO		Not Sure	
	F	%	F	%	F	%
Representing different stakeholders interests	52	63	3	3.6	28	33.7
Engaging in strategic planning and development	52	63	4	4.8	27	32.5
Stakeholder coordination and supporting implementation	54	65	2	2.4	27	32.5
Capacity building and provision of expertise	52	63	3	3.6	37	44.57

Roles of Educational and Training Bodies. Collectively, majority of the respondents from the NGOs expressed their support for sustainable tourism. This is shown on their responses in which 63% said “yes” in all of the four aspects of involvement specifically in representing the stakeholders’ interest, engaging in strategic planning and development, helped in coordinating and supporting implementation of tourism programs and even in capability building and

provision of expertise. Expectedly, as trainers and educators, they would be willing to share their expertise and engaged in capacity building.

One respondent said in an interview that he is very much willing to share his expertise in the field of *agri-tourism (mushroom production, organic agriculture)* as he is sharing this technology to other stakeholders to like schools, LGUs and others.

Likewise, other respondent group in this category can also be of helped in terms of *knowledge gathering and dissemination*. This is also expressed by other faculty-respondents since they believed that research endeavour is an important component in the tourism industry.

Table 8. Role of Educational and Training Bodies in Delivering Sustainable Tourism

Role of Educational Bodies and Institutions	RESPONSES		
	Yes	No	Not Sure
Knowledge gathering and dissemination	12		3
Supporting policy and strategy development	15	-	-
Capacity building and training	15	-	-
Specific Advice and expertise	15	-	-

Role of the Local Community. Majority of stakeholders from the local residents and barangay officials are desirous in engaging themselves in planning and decision making on tourism programs (60.6%), the rest boldly said “no” and few others said “not sure”. Other roles of the local community that are identified are: *“representing and communication local community interests; pursuing equitable benefits sharing within communities; Interacting with tourists to mutual benefit and reviewing income from tourist spending”*. These roles were boldly accepted by the majority of respondents who are barangay officials and concerned citizens since interest of the common people are on top of their priority. Besides, they believed that tourism is instrumental in promoting social and economic development and that, the community is looking for the possibility of bringing sustainable inclusive growth for all.

Table 9. Role of Local Community in Delivering Sustainable Tourism

Role of Local Community in Delivering Sustainable Tourism	RESPONSES (n=162)					
	YES		NO		Not Sure	
	F	%	F	%	F	%
Engaging in planning and decisions on tourism at a local level	98	60.5	8	4.9	56	34.5
Representing and communication local community interests	81	54	7	4.3	74	45.67
Pursuing equitable benefits sharing within communities	90	55.5	9	5.5	63	38.8
Interacting with tourists to mutual benefit	92	56.7	6	3.7	64	39.5
Reviewing income from tourist spending	87	54	11	6.7	64	39.5

SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Based from the results of the study, the following conclusions and recommendations are drawn:

1. The level of awareness in all types of stakeholders is high. This is attributed by the effective integrated communication (IMC) program of the PGIN in tourism promotion such as the use of social media, outdoor media, broadcasting media and other touch points. The IMC

campaign, *PaoayKumakay*, the tourism brand of the province which was launch in 2010 is now realizing its impact as manifested in the growth of tourists visiting this place. Media partners must also be strengthened to achieve wider publicity.

2. The level of involvement of the local community, NGOs (youth/women's group) is low in the formulation of tourism programs and activities is low. This is because, sometimes, it is difficult to bring people out of their comfort zone. Environmentalist from the NGOs/POs are moderately involved. There is a felt engagement of NGOs in local governance, however, as to what extent, it is unclear. Educational and training bodies are engaged because it is believed that they can contribute significant inputs like in the form of research work and advocacy campaign.

3. The level of involvement of the different groups of respondents is varied private sector businesses in implementing various programs of the provincial government. NGOs/POs and local community are at moderate extent. The local administrators are now beginning to realize the value of participation in tourism development.

4. All stakeholders such as the private sector businesses, the NGOs, local community and educational and training bodies are willing to support the provincial government in tourism development. This is proven by their willingness to accept if not assume the role associated in them.

5. Stakeholders participation or participatory governance as strategy for sustainable development is already manifested in the current administration of the province. This is shown from the involvement of stakeholders in the formulation implementation of various programs of the government.

6. Stakeholders participation promote political and economic empowerment and development. Involvement in formulation of plans promote sense of ownership and commitment in the implementation of every program. Development means more jobs, lesser poverty incidence.

Recommendations

Based from the aforementioned findings, the following recommendations are forwarded:

1. To sustain the level of awareness in all stakeholders and other markets, both local and international, the PGIN must continue the IMC campaign, with emphasis on the use of social media. The website must be maintained and updated to give insights to tourist stakeholders on the calendar of activities for the whole year. The local community particularly the youth shall be trained as advocates of tourism and enterprise development.

2. Expand involvement in the planning process by reaching wider group particularly the local community.

3. The culture of collaboration and volunteerism must developed in all segments of the society. This must be supported by laws and programs that promote empowerment. As one advocate suggests, there must be a change of heart.

4. If plans are co-established and visions are shared among stakeholders, then, everyone will be willing to do their own roles.

Conclusions

1. Tourism industry in IlocosNorte can be sustained through strong collaboration and commitment among different stakeholders.

2. To ensure effective participation among various groups, the provincial government must provide enabling environment and engaged them in capacity building not only among the youth but also NGOs/POs to make them more productive partners like Capacity building seminar must include topics on Strategic Planning and Team Building.

3. For governance to be meaningful, all stakeholders need to be active partners in pursuit of sustainable development, in the various aspects of governance like planning, implementation and evaluation.

4. It is also imperative to develop ordinary citizens to be more active members of the society. More active participation by the members would mean greater participation means greater empowerment.

5. Collaboration encompasses many types of cooperative efforts. The governor herself is a collaborative leader. She engages various groups in tourism planning and implementation.

6. Many are benefited from the tourism programs of the PGIN not only the service providers but also the local community through generation of direct jobs like tourist aides and the like. According to the data from Provincial Tourism Office, tourists aides who are deployed in tourist destinations are growing like in **2012- 200** tourist aides, **2013-258,2014-600**and 900 in 2015.

References

Official Website of the Provincial Government of Ilocos Norte

2012 Socio-Economic Profile of PGIN

Tourism Master Plan of PGIN

Sustainable Tourism for Development (World Tourism Organization)

Booher, D. E. 2007. **Collaborative governance**. *Encyclopedia of Public Administration and Public Policy*. Taylor and Francis, New York, New York, USA.

Booher, D. E., and J. E. Innes. 2002. Network power in collaborative planning. *Journal of Planning Education and Research* 21:221–236.

Duit, A., and V. Galaz. 2001. Governance and complexity: emerging issues for governance theory. *Governance: An International Journal of Policy Administration and Institutions*.

Kettl, D. 2002. *The transformance of governance: public administration for the 21st century*. Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, Maryland, USA.

Lucas, Francis B. and Tolentino, Maricel A. *Participatory Governance: A Future Charted With The People, For The People*. *Journal of Public Administration*

<http://www.unwto.org>